

Report to: Executive
Date: 13th March 2023
Report for: Decision
Report of: Executive Member for Health, Wellbeing, and Equalities

Report Title

Feedback from Trafford Citizens Survey for ‘Moving on from BAME Terminology’.

Summary

A Citizens Survey titled ‘Moving on from BAME Terminology’ went public on the 3rd to 31st of October to gather the views of people working and living in Trafford regarding which term should be used to describe people’s ethnicity. This is in response to the Government’s recommendations that public bodies stop using the term ‘BAME’ (black and minority ethnic) in their public documents and instead use the term ‘ethnic minorities’.

A report approved by CLT on 23rd September 2022 explained the reasons why staff feel it is important to consult with the wider public and community voluntary groups. This report provides a summary of the Citizens Survey feedback from the respondents and a recommendation for a new term which the majority supported to be used in Council documents going forward.

Recommendations

It is recommended that the Executive:

- I. Review the summary analysis and feedback from the Citizens Survey for ‘Moving on from BAME Terminology’.
- II. Agree that the results of this survey will be used to help determine an acceptable and appropriate term to use in the Council’s future documents and publications
- III. Approve the proposal that specific terms to describe various ethnic groups be used in Council documents as far as is possible and practical.
- IV. Approve the proposal that the term ‘ethnically diverse communities’ be used in the Council’s future documents and publications instead of

BAME – Black and minority ethnic.

Contact person for access to background papers and further information:

Name: Dianne Geary/ Adele Coyne

Extension: 1821/4605

Implications:

Relationship to Policy Framework/Corporate Priorities	There is an Equality Strategy and Action Plan to deliver the Council's Equality duty which includes the protected characteristic of 'race'. The Strategy is also linked to the corporate priorities, reducing health inequalities, supporting people out of poverty and addressing the climate crisis. Increased equality will support the delivery of all these priorities.
Relationship to GM Policy or Strategy Framework	The decision relates to a proposal by the GM Race Panel and GM Equality Alliance.
Financial	No direct impact
Legal Implications:	Legal advice is provided in relations to equality work as and when required – this work is responding to Government guidance
Equality/Diversity Implications	The decision contributes to the promotion of equality, diversity and inclusion.
Sustainability Implications	There is nothing in the report that would undermine our sustainability plans
Carbon Reduction	The Equality Strategy aims to improve life opportunities which can assist in supporting carbon reduction
Resource Implications e.g., Staffing / ICT / Assets	No direct impact
Risk Management Implications	This reduces the risk of the Council being exposed to discrimination claims caused by failure to demonstrate compliance with equalities legislation.
Health & Wellbeing Implications	Health and wellbeing will be improved through the implementation of this proposal in that it respects and takes into consideration the views of residents.
Health and Safety Implications	No direct impact

1.0 Background

- 1.1 On 23rd September 2022 the Corporate Leadership Team approved the proposal to publish a Citizens Survey for 'Moving on from BAME Terminology' and the proposal to undertake targeted focus group discussions.
- 1.2 CLT also agreed that the analysis and feedback from the above activity, which will help determine Trafford's long-term approach, is brought back to CLT.
- 1.3 The work undertaken to consult with people in Trafford is in response to a key recommendation in a Government Report of the Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities published on 31st March 2021. The Report recommended that public bodies stop using the term 'BAME' (black and minority ethnic) in their public documents and instead use the term 'ethnic minorities'.
- 1.4 In addition, Greater Manchester Equality Alliance together with the GM Race Equality Panel suggested the use of 'People Experiencing Race Inequalities' (PERI) and 'Communities Experiencing Race Inequalities' (CERI). The GM Equality Officers Group commented that the views of people in our communities should be considered.
- 1.5 The suggestions from the Government Report and GM Equality Alliance were shared and discussed with Trafford's BAME Staff Network, the Equality Steering and Working Groups. Following these discussions, several members of the **Equality Working Group** formed a Focus Group in October 2021 including colleagues from Access Trafford, Public Health, Communications, the BAME Staff Network, HR and Trafford NHS Locality Integrated Care Board (ICB).
- 1.6 Concern was expressed that little consultation has taken place about this very complex and sensitive issue with people, particularly with those of BAME backgrounds working and living in our borough.
- 1.7 The Focus Group's task was to consider what it would mean for the Council to stop using the term BAME (Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic) in our Council documents, and consider possible alternative terms while recognising the need to take into account people's views. After a few meetings, the Focus Group chose to widen consultation with people, particularly those from ethnically diverse backgrounds working and living in our borough.
- 1.8 The Executive Lead for Health and Wellbeing and Equalities is supportive of this approach and has asked to be kept informed of progress. Updates have also been included in the Equality Strategy Progress Reports to Executive in January 2022 and July 2022.

2.0 The Citizen Survey process

- 2.1 The Citizens' Survey was circulated amongst a wide group of colleagues for comment before sharing with CLT. Following a review of the questions by CLT, the Survey was shared with the Executive Members before going live on 3rd October until 31st October.
- 2.2 The survey included questions about the demographics of respondents, if they were living and/or working in Trafford and if they were responding as an individual or on behalf of a community group.
- 2.3 Small focus group meetings were held with representatives from Voice of BME-Trafford, the African-Caribbean Care Group and Manchester Gymkhana to gain an organisational perspective, during the consultation period. Please see Appendix 1 for the full list of organisations that responded.
- 2.4 Additional feedback from previous consultations with the BAME Staff Network, the Focus Group and individual comments from colleagues and partner organisations representatives helped to inform the shaping of the survey questions.
- 2.5 20 respondents declared that they worked for Trafford Council.
- 2.6 This report provides a summary of the findings of the survey. Copies of the more detailed analysis and breakdown of data are available on request.

3.0 Summary of Findings of Citizens Survey – 'Moving on from BAME Terminology'.

3.1 Response level and demographic

There were 312 respondents overall. When compared to consultations which have taken place over a similar length of time, this is a much higher than average response rate. There was a good cross section of people who responded, in terms of ethnicity and age. A small majority of people (54%) identified as White British, against the overall make-up of the borough of 86%.

3.2. Should we avoid BAME?

With regards to whether we should avoid BAME, it was clear that most people agreed with the statement, with 74% agreeing overall and little variance between the different groupings.

'I disagree with separating out Black and Asian from other ethnic minorities when using a collective description for ethnic minorities. I also feel Black and Asian in themselves are overbroad and crude terms – one describing skin colour but not ethnicity and the other covering numerous vastly different ethnicities'.

'It is an outdated term and I have had discussions with Black colleagues who feel that the word minority reinforces the idea that Black and Asian people are less important/less valued.'

'I think the acronym has become a word with negative connotations.'

3.3 Using CERl and PERl

More people overall (61%) disagreed that either of these terms should be used, although a small majority of younger people agreed it should be used in official papers and communications. However, an overall term needs to be both liked and also not disliked.

'I think if terms like CERl and PERl replace BAME then it would label everyone who is minority ethnic as a victim. If the terms are to be used, I would suggest they are used more specifically to refer to specific communities suffering demonstrable racial inequality rather than as a blanket term for ethnic minorities as a whole.'

'It overlooks the disparities between experiences of different communities – also PERl has associations with health terminology (perimenopause/perinatal) which is unhelpful.'

'This makes minorities out to be victims.'

'Depends on what category the term is being used in. If this is a blanket term in every report then no, if there is a category that is only for people experiencing racism then yes.'

3.4 Using specific terms

There was strong agreement from all sections that specific terms should be used when appropriate, reaching up to 93% of younger people.

'Be detailed in who you are talking or writing about.'

'Agree with this, however there is such a diverse community in Trafford that it would be impossible to know all the terms for the different groups/communities of people.'

'Every ethnicity deserves to be individually recognised.'

'This should always be the preference wherever possible.'

3.5 Using the term 'Ethnic Minorities'

There was a split almost down the middle regarding this term which was suggested in the Government report that public bodies use. In terms of disagreement, there weren't many people strongly against. However, neither was there strong approval for the term. It seems to be a term that wasn't found to be offensive, but it isn't particularly well liked.

'Prefer this to BAME due to the exclusion of some communities. I think BAME makes people just think about black and Asian minorities.'

'Yes, this is the correct term and not derogative.'

'I would prefer being specific, but this is a sensible option and not inflammatory.'

'Doesn't really describe the diversity of people in communities, leaves out the colour aspect i.e., Black and many diverse groups are no longer in the minority in many parts of the UK today'.

'Puts everyone in one box and does not create awareness amongst professionals/decision makers as the ethnicities of people of local people'.

'It seems like a retrograde step and old terminology. If it's going to change it should be something those communities themselves choose'.

3.6 Preferred term

There was a clear preferred term for all the groups that completed the survey and this was for 'Ethnically Diverse Communities', with it being ranked in the top two in all groups. Significantly, this term was also the least disliked of all the options. This is important as a term needs to be found that people want to use, but it also needs to be a term that everyone will be OK to use and not provoke alienation.

Like Black Asian and ethnically diverse communities or Ethnically Diverse Communities as they are more positively phrased than the other options.

There weren't many comments for this term or any that would detract from the majority view but the analysis of statistical feedback showed a consistent preference for this term.

3.7 Overall Analysis of Comments in Survey from cross Council Focus Group

- People want to understand the need for changing the terminology and understand more about the governance around this.
- Several people said we should avoid using a catch-all term.
- The comments in the survey add value and endorse a particular term such as 'ethnically diverse communities'. The overall rejection of PER/CERI and mention of how this makes people feel like victims reinforces the sense of a consensus and is reassuring for the Council going forward.
- Ethnic minorities feels like we are going backwards and sounds negative. Diversity sounds more positive and inclusive.
- Approximately 60% of 312 respondents have commented which adds value to the statistical data and findings.
- Several people from white backgrounds said they felt they were unsure about or should not be answering the survey questions as they are not from the ethnic backgrounds that terms such as BAME refer to.

4.0 Communicating the message.

- 4.1 If CLT approve the recommendation to replace 'BAME' with the agreed chosen term of 'ethnically diverse communities', consideration needs to be given as to how best to communicate this message from the Council to our respective service areas and to colleagues in GMCA.
- 4.2 To date, no further updates have been received from other GM local authorities about how they are following up GM's proposed terms or any alternatives. Nor has any feedback come from an NHS survey.

5.0 Reasons for Recommendations

- 5.1 Consulting with a wide range of people living and working in Trafford demonstrates that we are respecting people's dignity when we ask them what terms they would like to be described by. This is evident in some of the feedback where respondents stated the following:

'This conversation/need to change, is long overdue in Trafford. I, for one, am thankful it is being reviewed, as a person of colour myself I am in constant conflict having to write BAME terminology in my reports'

'Thanks for the opportunity to feedback. It's nice to be asked about the language'

'I think it's important to describe minorities instead of lumping everyone into one. And inevitable excluding representation of others. I definitely don't appreciate being called BAME. It's important to get to know your cohort. It's not hard to educate yourself about the background of the people you refer to. Thanks for creating this survey'

'May I ask that you "Please" consult people of colour before coming up with these names'

'Well done for asking people. I'm white, but I think it's so important that all of our voices are heard'

- 5.2 If the Council supports the recommendation to use the term 'ethnically diverse communities', this should be used with caution as one respondent stated:

'Not all ethnically diverse communities (EDCs) are of colour'

It may still often be necessary to specifically refer to people from Black African-Caribbean, South Asian and Middle Eastern backgrounds as well in some Council documents, depending on the context.

- 5.3 Given the work completed to date and the above findings of the survey, it is recommended that the Corporate Leadership Team:

- i) Review the summary analysis and feedback from the Citizens Survey for 'Moving on from BAME Terminology'.
- ii) Agree that the results of this survey will be used to help determine an acceptable and appropriate term to use in the Council's future documents and publications
- iii) Approve proposal that specific terms to describe various ethnic groups be used in Council documents as far as is possible and practical.
- iv) Approve the proposal that the term 'ethnically diverse communities' be used in the Council's future documents and publications.

Appendix 1

External Organisations whose representative/members completed the Survey

- African Caribbean Care Group
- Sports Work Ltd
- Pakistani Resource Centre
- Manchester Gymkhana
- Young Identity
- Caribbean and African Health Network (CAHN)
- Earth Clinic and School
- Trafford College
- Talk Listen Change
- Can Survive UK
- New Testament of God
- Urmston Primary School
- Voice of BME Trafford

Appendix 2

Comments from some Organisations

Voice of BME Trafford said:

BAME represents a wider community however it does not include the Chinese population. The Chinese people want to be just Chinese.

We do not see why we cannot use CERI, PERI and BAME together in context. It should not replace BAME. It makes it look like you are addressing a community that has been victimised. It undermines community cohesion 'cos it makes people feel they are inferior.

Ethnic Minorities is stripping people's identity 'cos I don't know the context, reason or evidence for this. Ethnic Minorities is removing Black and Asian and people are used to it. Felt early on that BAME was dividing people but now it's here and we all understand it. Will using Ethnic Minorities make it harder to apply for funds 'cos too general. When talking about BAME communities we can see who you are talking about.

We would say diverse communities rather than ethnically diverse. Worry that division is coming in with some terms

African Caribbean Care Group said:

Black should be included as important to retain this.

Where possible, referring to a particular community directly in reports is preferable to using acronyms.

New Testament Church of God said:

BAME provides clarity on the different ethnic groups

The experience of Black people has been found in recent times to be significantly different to other ethnic groups

Manchester Gymkhana said:

Address a group directly - This is particularly important from a health and well-being perspective as each group has unique characteristics which define their needs for health treatment. It also would demonstrate the cultural sensitivities of each community i.e., tone or voice or language used

Ethnic Minorities – It's important to maintain the word minority otherwise it becomes difficult to segment society and potentially channel resources to those who most need it because they are in the minority. We are unsure on the term Ethnic as it suggests its only for people of colour.

Our preference leans closer Ethnically diverse communities/Ethnic Minorities. The choice of People of Colour would be our third option

Appendix 3

Please see table below for a detailed breakdown of statistical data from the Citizen's Survey.

Question	Overall	White British*	Younger People*	Live in Trafford	Work in Trafford
Number of responses	312	167	56	217	216
Should we avoid BAME (agree/ strongly agree)	74%	77%	75%	75%	77%
Using CERI or PERI (disagree/ strongly disagree)	61%	62%	48%	65%	60%
Using specific terms eg Black African women (agree/ strongly agree)	87%	87%	93%	88%	91%
Using the term 'Ethnic Minorities'					
Agree	47%	48%	<u>55%</u>	<u>51%</u>	48%
Disagree	<u>51%</u>	<u>52%</u>	45%	49%	<u>52%</u>
Preferred Terms (ranking)					
BAME (top two)	16%	14%	12%	21%	16%
(bottom two)	30%	29%	29%	25%	33%
Black Asian and ethnic communities (top two)	13%	16%	12%	15%	16%
(bottom two)	19%	20%	22%	23%	20%
Black Asian and ethnically diverse communities (top two)	13%	13%	14%	12%	16%
(bottom two)	12%	20%	16%	12%	14%
People Experiencing Racial Inequality (top two)	20%	26%	25%	17%	24%
(bottom two)	27%	28%	33%	30%	31%
Communities Experiencing Racial Inequality (top two)	22%	27%	34%	41%	26%
(bottom two)	28%	33%	30%	22%	29%
Ethnic Minorities (top two)	34%	36%	38%	35%	36%
(bottom two)	15%	15%	14%	14%	20%
Ethnically Diverse Communities (top two)	<u>43%</u>	<u>47%</u>	<u>52%</u>	<u>53%</u>	<u>49%</u>
(bottom two)	<u>6%</u>	<u>9%</u>	<u>10%</u>	<u>6%</u>	<u>8%</u>
People of Colour (top two)	18%	22%	14%	23%	19%
(bottom two)	37%	44%	44%	51%	46%